

Talk 9: Critical Apparatus

James Cummings

July 2009

Critical Apparatus

Scholarly editions of texts, especially texts of great antiquity or importance, often record some or all of the known variations among different witnesses to the text. Witnesses to a text may include authorial or other manuscripts, printed editions of the work, early translations, or quotations of a work in other texts. The TEI provides methods for encoding not only an existing critical apparatus, but also ways to mark up a text so that such an apparatus can be generated (without the limitations of necessarily choosing a base text).

Format of an apparatus

The format of an apparatus usually has several parts:

- The location of the variant in the text (act, scene, line number)
- The lemma, which is the portion of the text to which the note applies
- A right bracket (]) or some other separator
- The source from which the edition took its reading
- A list of variants, in each case followed by the source in which the variant is found, and usually separated with a semicolon.

Apparatus Criticus

The standard *Apparatus Criticus* provides a concise method of recording the variants for any size of text. To take an example, a line in *Hamlet* might be printed as:

LAERTES. Alas, then she is drowned.

with a critical apparatus provided (usually at the foot of the page) which contained:

4. 7. 156 Alas, then is she drowned.] HIBBARD; Alas then, is she drown'd? F; Alas then is she drownd. Q3; Alas, then, she is drownd. Q2; So, she is drownde: Q1.

Critical Apparatus: <app>, <rdg>, and <lem>

- <app> (apparatus entry) contains one entry in a critical apparatus, with an optional lemma and at least one reading.
- <rdg> (reading) contains a single reading within a textual variation.
- <lem> (lemma) contains the lemma, or base text, of a textual variation.

Example of <app>, <rdg> and <lem>

```
<l>  
  <app>  
    <lem wit="#E1">Experience though noon Auctoritee</lem>  
    <rdg wit="#Hg">Experience thogh noon Auctoorite</rdg>  
    <rdg wit="#La">Experiment thoh noon Auctoritee</rdg>  
    <rdg wit="#Ra2">Eryment thogh none auctoorite</rdg>  
  </app>  
</l>
```

Or apparatus at smaller granularity

```

<l>
  <app>
    <lem wit="#El #Hg">Experience</lem>
    <rdg type="substantive" wit="#La">Experiment</rdg>
    <rdg type="substantive" wit="#Ra2">Eryment</rdg>
  </app>
  <app>
    <lem wit="#El #Ra2">though</lem>
    <rdg type="orthographic" wit="#Hg">thogh</rdg>
    <rdg type="orthographic" wit="#La">thouh</rdg>
  </app>
  <app>
    <lem wit="#El #La #Hg">noon</lem>
    <rdg type="orthographic" wit="#Ra2">none</rdg>
  </app>
  <app>
    <lem wit="#El #La">Auctoritee</lem>
    <rdg type="orthographic" wit="#Hg">Auctorite</rdg>
    <rdg type="orthographic" wit="#Ra2">auctorite</rdg>
  </app>
</l>

```

<rdgGrp>, <witDetail>, and <wit>

<rdgGrp> (reading group) within a textual variation, groups two or more readings perceived to have a genetic relationship or other affinity.

<witDetail> (witness detail) gives further information about a particular witness, or witnesses, to a particular reading.

<wit> (witness) contains a list of one or more sigla of witnesses attesting a given reading, in a textual variation.

<rdgGrp> Example

```

<app type="substantive">
  <rdgGrp type="subvariants">
    <lem wit="#E1 #Hg">Experience</lem>
    <rdg wit="#Ha4">Experiens</rdg>
  </rdgGrp>
  <rdgGrp type="subvariants">
    <lem wit="#Cp #Ld1">Experiment</lem>
    <rdg wit="#La">Ex&amp; p- underbar; iment</rdg>
  </rdgGrp>
  <rdgGrp type="subvariants">
    <lem>Eriment<wit>[ unattested] </wit>
    </lem>
    <rdg wit="#Ra2">Eryment</rdg>
  </rdgGrp>
</app>

```

<witDetail> Example

```
<app type="substantive">
  <rdgGrp type="subvariants">
    <lem wit="#E1 #Hg" xml:id="#W026">Experience</lem>
    <rdg wit="#Ha4">Experiens</rdg>
  </rdgGrp>
</app>
<witDetail resp="#PR" target="#W026" wit="#E1"> Ornamental capital.
</witDetail>
```

<listWit> and <witness>

- <listWit> (witness list) lists definitions for all the witnesses referred to by a critical apparatus, optionally grouped hierarchically.
- <witness> contains either a description of a single witness referred to within the critical apparatus, or a list of witnesses which is to be referred to by a single sigil.

One should also use a <msDesc> instead of a <witness> if more information is available.

<listWit> example

```
<listWit>  
  <witness xml:id="El">Ellesmere, Huntingdon Library 26.C.9</witness>  
  <witness xml:id="Hg">Hengwrt, National Library of Wales,  
    Aberystwyth, Peniarth 392D</witness>  
  <witness xml:id="ms">Sole manuscript</witness>  
  <witness xml:id="Ra2">Bodleian Library Rawlinson Poetic 149  
    (see further <ptr target="#MSRP149"/>)</witness>  
</listWit>
```

Nested <listWit>

Witnesses that are similar can be grouped together so that they can be referred by a single siglum:

```
<listWit>
  <witness xml:id="Ellesmere">Ellesmere, Huntingdon Library 26. C. 9</witness>
<!-- ... -->
  <listWit xml:id="Con">
    <head>Constant Group C</head>
    <witness xml:id="Cp">Corpus Christi Oxford MS 198 </witness>
    <witness xml:id="La">British Library Lansdowne 851 </witness>
    <witness xml:id="Sl2">British Library Sloane MS 1686 </witness>
  </listWit>
</listWit>
<!-- elsewhere -->
<rdg wit="#Con">Experiment</rdg>
```

refers to all these manuscripts.

Fragmentary Witnesses

- `<witStart>` (fragmented witness start) indicates the beginning, or resumption, of the text of a fragmentary witness
- `<witEnd>` (fragmented witness end) indicates the end, or suspension, of the text of a fragmentary witness.
- `<lacunaStart>` indicates the beginning of a lacuna in the text of a mostly complete textual witness.
- `<lacunaEnd>` indicates the end of a lacuna in a mostly complete textual witness.

Fragmentary Witnesses Example

```
<app>
  <lem wit="#E1 #Hg">Auctoritee</lem>
  <rdg wit="#La #Ra2">auctorite</rdg>
  <rdg wit="#X">
    <lacunaEnd/>auctorite</rdg>
</app>
```

or

```
<app>
  <lem wit="#E1 #Hg">Auctoritee</lem>
  <rdg wit="#La #Ra2">auctorite</rdg>
  <rdg wit="#X">
    <witStart/>auctorite</rdg>
</app>
```

Location Referenced Example

```

<div n="WBP" type="prologue">
  <head>The Prologe of the Wyves Tale of Bathe</head>
  <l n="1">Experience though noon Auctoritee</l>
  <l>Were in this world ...</l>
</div>
<!-- Elsewhere in Document: -->
<app loc="WBP 1">
  <rdg wit="#La">Experiment</rdg>
  <rdg wit="#Ra2">Eryment</rdg>
</app>

```

or

```

<l n="1">Experience though noon Auctoritee
<app>
  <rdg wit="#La"> Experiment</rdg>
  <rdg wit="#Ra2"> Eryment</rdg>
</app>
</l>
<l>Were in this world ...</l>

```


Double End-Point Attachment Example

```
<div n="WBP" type="prologue">
  <head>The Prologe ... </head>
  <l n="1" xml:id="WBP.1">Experience<anchor xml:id="WBP-A2"/>
    though noon Auctoritee</l>
  <l>Were in this world ...</l>
</div>
<!-- Elsewhere in the same document -->
<app from="#WBP.1" to="#WBP-A2">
  <rdg wit="#La">Experiment</rdg>
  <rdg wit="#Ra2">Eryment</rdg>
</app>
```

Parallel Segmentation Example

```

<l n="1">
  <app>
    <rdg wit="#Chi3">Auctoritee, though none experience</rdg>
    <rdg>
      <app>
        <rdg wit="#El #Hg">Experience</rdg>
        <rdg wit="#La">Experiment</rdg>
        <rdg wit="#Ra2">Eryment</rdg>
      </app>
      <app>
        <rdg wit="#El #Ra2">though</rdg>
        <rdg wit="#Hg">thogh</rdg>
        <rdg wit="#La">thouh</rdg>
      </app>
      <app>
        <rdg wit="#El #Hg">noon Auctorite</rdg>
        <rdg wit="#La #Ra2">none auctorite</rdg>
      </app>
    </rdg>
  </app>
</l>

```

A Simple <app> With No <l em>

```

<ab> Populus domini et oves pascuae eius <app>
  <rdg
    wit="#CA0-B #CA0-V #CA0-R #CA0-D #CA0-F #CA0-S #Ely #Wor #Wcb"> venite
adoremus eum</rdg>
  <rdg wit="#CA0-H #Pet"> venite adoremus deum</rdg>
  <rdg wit="#CA0-E #Alb2"> venite adoremus dominum</rdg>
  <rdg wit="#CA0-C #CA0-G #CA0-L #Hyd #Evm"> venite
    adoremus</rdg>
  </app>
</ab>

```

Attaching Notes Example

Virginite is grete

```

<app>
  <rdg resp="#ES">perfecti<abbr>oi</abbr>
</rdg>
  <rdg resp="#FJF" xml:id="f105"> perfectio<expan>u</expan>n</rdg>
  <rdg resp="#PGR" xml:id="r105"> perfectiou<expan>n</expan>
</rdg>
</app>
<!-- ... <note> appearing elsewhere in the document ... -->
<note target="#r105 #f105">Furnivall's expansion implies that the bar is an
abbreviation for 'u'. There are no certain instances of this mark as an
abbreviation for 'u' in these MSS and it is widely used as an abbreviation for
'n'. Ruggiers' expansion is to
be accepted. </note>

```

Hamlet example

Think back to the example given from *Hamlet*:

LAERTES. Alas, then she is drowned.

Where the traditional critical apparatus contained:

4.7.156 Alas, then is she drowned.] HIBBARD; Alas then, is she drown'd? F;
Alas then is she drownd. Q3; Alas, then, she is drownd. Q2; So, she is
drownde: Q1.

How would **you** choose to mark it up in TEI?

How I'd do it (given time)

```

<l n="156">
  <app>
    <rdg wit="#Hib">Alas, then</rdg>
    <rdg wit="#F">Alas then,</rdg>
    <rdg wit="#Q3">Alas then</rdg>
    <rdg wit="#Q2">Alas, then,</rdg>
    <rdg wit="#Q1">So,</rdg>
  </app>
  <app>
    <rdg wit="#Hib #F #Q3">is she</rdg>
    <rdg wit="#Q2 #Q1">she is</rdg>
  </app>
  <app>
    <rdg wit="#Hib">drowned.</rdg>
    <rdg wit="#F">drown 'd?</rdg>
    <rdg wit="#Q3 #Q2">drownd.</rdg>
    <rdg wit="#Q1">drownde:</rdg>
  </app>
</l>

```